

# Action Minutes *Historic District Commission*

**Meeting Date/Time:** May 12, 2015 from 6:31 p.m. to 8:26 p.m.

- Members Present: Benjamin Brodey (Chair), Craig Carbrey, Cari Filer (Vice Chair), Iris Schwintzer, Jim Spencer, Mary-Frances Vogler, Jim White
- **Members Absent:** Kimberly Kyser, Vicki Parrott, Alan Rimer (Deputy Vice Chair)

Staff Present: Eric Feld

| Agenda Item   | Discussion/Motions/Votes   | Action  |
|---|--|---|
| Call to order   | N/A  | Meeting called to order at 6:31 p.m.  |
| Reading of governing laws and documents into the record   | N/A  | Staff read into the record pertinent laws and documents.  |
| Swearing in of those wishing to<br>provide evidence and testimony   | N/A  | N/A   |
| <b>Consent Agenda</b><br>214 Pittsboro Street (Newman<br>Catholic Student Center Parish) –<br>New ground sign, wall sign, and<br>directional sign | <ul> <li>Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner Spencer seconded, moving the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for 214 Pittsboro Street to consent agenda. <u>Vote: 7-0</u>.</li> <li>Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner Carbrey seconded, approving a Certificate of Appropriateness for 214 Pittsboro Street for reasons H (appurtenant fixtures and other features such as lighting) and J (architectural scale). <u>Vote: 7-0</u>.</li> </ul> | The Commission voted to move the<br>Certificate of Appropriateness<br>application for 214 Pittsboro Street<br>to the consent agenda.<br>The Commission voted to approve<br>the Certificate of Appropriateness<br>application for the proposed<br>changes at 214 Pittsboro Street. |

| Old Business: Hearings On Certificate<br>of Appropriateness Applications<br>201 East Franklin Street (Time Out<br>Restaurant) – New signs on awnings,<br>building facades, windows, and door | Commissioner Spencer motioned, Commissioner Vogler seconded, to<br>recuse Commissioner Carbrey from the meeting. <u>Vote: 6-0</u> .<br>(Commissioner Carbrey did not vote.)<br>Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner White seconded, to close<br>the public portion of the hearing. <u>Vote: 6-0</u> .<br>Commissioner White motioned, Commissioner Schwintzer seconded, to<br>approve the following portions of the Certificate of Appropriateness<br>application for 201 East Franklin Street: wall sign above Henderson     | The Commission voted to recuse<br>Commissioner Carbrey from the<br>meeting.<br>The Commission voted to approve<br>the Certificate of Appropriateness<br>application for portions of the<br>proposed changes at 201 East<br>Franklin Street. |
|--|--|---|
|  | <ul> <li>Street. The reason for approval is as follows: F (proportion, shape, positioning and location, pattern, and size of any elements of fenestration). Vote: 6-0.</li> <li>Commissioner Spencer motioned, Commissioner Vogler seconded, to return Commissioner Carbrey to the hearing. Vote: 6-0. (Commissioner Carbrey did not vote.)</li> </ul>   | The Commission voted to return<br>Commissioner Carbrey to the<br>meeting.   |
| New Business: Hearings On<br>Certificate of Appropriateness<br>Applications<br>203 3/4 East Franklin Street (Lyceum<br>Tattoo & Piercing Arts Studio) – New<br>projecting sign               | Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner Vogler seconded, to close<br>the public portion of the hearing. <u>Vote: 7-0</u> .<br>Commissioner White motioned, Commissioner Carbrey seconded,<br>approving a Certificate of Appropriateness for 203 ¾ East Franklin Street<br>for reasons H (appurtenant fixtures and other features such as lighting)<br>and J (architectural scale). <u>Vote: 6-1</u> . Commissioner Brodey voted nay<br>because the architectural scale is incongruous with the surrounding<br>historic district. | The Commission voted to approve<br>the Certificate of Appropriateness<br>application for the proposed<br>changes at 203 3/4 East Franklin<br>Street.  |

| 211 Pittsboro Street (Carolina Inn) –<br>Patio and walkway renovations | Commissioner Spencer motioned, Commissioner White seconded, to recuse Commissioner Carbrey from the meeting. <u>Vote: 6-0</u> . (Commissioner Carbrey did not vote.)  | The Commission voted to recuse<br>Commissioner Carbrey from the<br>meeting.  |
|--|---|--|
|  | Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner Vogler seconded, to close<br>the public portion of the hearing. <u>Vote: 6-0</u> .<br>Commissioner Spencer motioned, Commissioner Filer seconded,<br>approving a Certificate of Appropriateness for 211 Pittsboro Street for<br>reasons C (exterior construction materials, including texture and pattern),<br>D (architectural detailing, such as lintels, cornices, brick bond, and<br>foundation materials), E (roof shapes, forms, and materials), G (general<br>form and proportions of buildings and structures), H (appurtenant<br>fixtures and other features such as lighting), and J (architectural scale).<br><u>Vote: 6-0</u> .<br>Commissioner Vogler motioned, Commissioner Filer seconded, to return<br>Commissioner Carbrey to the hearing. <u>Vote: 6-0.</u> (Commissioner Carbrey<br>did not vote.) | The Commission voted to approve<br>the Certificate of Appropriateness<br>application for the proposed<br>changes at 211 Pittsboro Street.<br>The Commission voted to return<br>Commissioner Carbrey to the<br>meeting. |

| 705 Gimghoul Road – Extend garage<br>bay, living room addition with<br>terrace, extend copper metal roofing, | Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner White seconded, to recuse<br>Commissioner Spencer from the meeting. <u>Vote: 6-0</u> . (Commissioner<br>Spencer did not vote.)  | The Commission voted to recuse<br>Commissioner Spencer from the<br>meeting.  |
|--|---|--|
| and new stone terraced planters  | <ul> <li>Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner White seconded, to close the public portion of the hearing. <u>Vote: 6-0</u>.</li> <li>Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner Carbrey seconded, to reopen the public portion of the hearing. <u>Vote: 6-0</u>.</li> <li>Commissioner Carbrey motioned, Commissioner Filer seconded, to close the public portion of the hearing. <u>Vote: 6-0</u>.</li> <li>Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner White seconded, to postpone the hearing until the June 9, 2015 meeting. <u>Vote: 4-2</u>. (Commissioner Schwintzer and Commissioner Carbrey voted nay.)</li> <li>Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner White seconded, to return Commissioner Spencer to the hearing. <u>Vote: 6-0</u>. (Commissioner Spencer to the hearing. <u>Vote: 6-0</u>.</li> </ul> | The Commission voted to postpone<br>the Certificate of Appropriateness<br>application hearing regarding<br>proposed changes at 705 Gimghoul<br>Road until the June 9, 2015 meeting.<br>The Commission voted to return<br>Commissioner Spencer to the<br>meeting. |
| <b>Courtesy Review</b><br>214 West Cameron Avenue – Rear<br>building addition                                | N/A   | The applicant described the proposed project, and the Commission provided feedback.  |

| Recommendations to Council<br>Appointments to the Historic District<br>Commission<br>• Craig Carbrey<br>• Elizabeth Farris<br>• Mary-Frances Vogler | Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner White seconded,<br>recommending that the Town Council reappoint Craig Carbrey to the<br>Historic District Commission. <u>Vote: 7-0</u> .<br>Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner Carbrey seconded,<br>recommending that the Town Council reappoint Mary-Frances Vogler to<br>the Historic District Commission. <u>Vote: 7-0</u> .<br>Commissioner Filer motioned, Commissioner Vogler seconded,<br>postponing a recommendation to the Town Council on Elizabeth Farris's<br>application for appointment to the Historic District Commission until the<br>June 9, 2015 meeting. <u>Vote: 7-0</u> . | The Commission voted to<br>recommend that the Council<br>reappoint Craig Carbrey to the<br>Historic District Commission.<br>The Commission voted to<br>recommend that the Council<br>reappoint Mary-Frances Vogler to<br>the Historic District Commission.<br>The Commission postponed voting<br>on a recommendation to the Town<br>Council regarding Elizabeth Farris's<br>application for appointment to the<br>Historic District Commission until<br>the June 9, 2015 meeting. |
|---|--|---|
| Action Minutes<br>April 14, 2015  | Commissioner Spencer motioned, Commissioner Craig seconded, to approve the post-meeting action minutes from the April 14, 2015 meeting as submitted. <u>Vote: 7-0</u> .  | The Commission approved the post-<br>meeting action minutes as<br>submitted for the April 14, 2015<br>meeting.  |
| June 10, 2014   | Commissioner Brodey motioned, Commissioner Vogler seconded, to approve the post-meeting action minutes from the June 10, 2014 meeting as submitted. <u>Vote: 7-0</u> .   | The Commission approved the post-<br>meeting action minutes as<br>submitted for the June 10, 2014<br>meeting.   |
| Next meeting  | June 9, 2015 at 6:30 p.m.  | N/A   |
| Remarks and Adjournment   | Commissioner Vogler motioned, Commissioner Carbrey seconded, to adjourn the meeting. <u>Vote: 7-0.</u>   | The Commission voted to adjourn the meeting at 8:26 p.m.  |